



An  NFP Company

School Board of Clay County 2025 Medical ASO Proposal Analysis

**Blue Cross Blue Shield
UnitedHealthcare**

School Board Workshop
March 25, 2025



RFP Final Ranking and Award Posting

RFP # 25-BA-131 SELF-INSURED MEDICAL ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES ONLY (ASO)			
VENDOR	RECEIVED / OPENED	PRELIMINARY SCORE with RANKING Total of All Members	FINAL SCORE with RANKING Total of All Members
	BY PURCHASING STAFF DURING RFP OPENING Time/Date: 2:00 P.M., February 10, 2025	BY SELECTION COMMITTEE DURING MEETING Time/Date: 2:00 P.M., February 26, 2025	BY SELECTION COMMITTEE DURING MEETING Time/Date: 3:00 P.M., March 4, 2025
Aetna/Meritain Health	Opened	50+77+80+82+78+90+67+35+40=599 (4)	
Cigna	Opened	70+65+72+75+91+93+82+60+79=687 (3)	80+75+90+86+70+90+94+60+93=738 (3)
Blue Cross/Blue Shield	Opened	75+83+55+87+91+98+92+80+75=736 (1)	90+95+30+94+80+100+85+90+96=760 (2)
United Healthcare	Opened	65+65+90+75+96+93+71+45+100=700 (2)	80+75+95+94+100+100+75+55+99=773 (1)
RECOMMENDATION: Intent to award Request for Proposal to United Healthcare and/or Blue Cross Blue Shield, the two highest ranked qualified Contractors upon evaluation of proposals. Award shall be contingent upon successful negotiations, and final awarded contract by the School Board of Clay County. Failure to file a protest within the time prescribed in section 120.57(3), Florida Statutes, or failure to post the bond or other security required by law within the time allowed for filing a bond shall constitute a waiver of proceedings under chapter 120, Florida Statutes			

RFP Recommendation Award was posted publicly on March 12th at 12 PM EST by the purchasing department.

Financial Analysis

Administrative Financials – High Level Overview



	UnitedHealthcare (Current)	UnitedHealthcare (Renewal)	BCBS ²	
Administrative Fee ¹	\$45.61	\$40.50	\$41.49	
Total Average Network Discount	-	68.1%	72.2%	
Discount Difference in Claims from Current	-	-	(\$3,016,268)	
Technology Credit	-	-	\$25,000 Annually	
Fee Holiday	-	-	1% of In-Network Shared Savings for a \$8.00 administrative credit (applied alternatively below).	
Wellness Credit	\$237,500 Annually	-	\$200,000 Year 1	
			\$100,000 Years 2-5	
Administrative Credit	-	\$700,000 Year 1	-	
		\$400,000 Years 2-5		
Rate Guarantee	-	5 Years	5 Years	
Runout Administrative Costs	-	6 Months UnitedHealthcare Runout Costs	\$263,000	
		12 Months UnitedHealthcare Runout Costs	\$393,000	
			Without Credit	With Credit
Monthly Administrative Fee	\$135,234	\$120,083	\$123,018	\$99,298
Annual Administrative Fee	\$1,622,804	\$1,440,990	\$1,476,214	\$1,191,574
Year 1 Credits	(\$237,500)	(\$700,000)	(\$225,000)	
Year 1 Net Administrative Costs	\$1,385,304	\$740,990	\$1,644,214	\$1,359,574
2024 Claims Repriced with Applied Network Discount	\$23,468,035	\$23,468,035	\$20,451,767	
Year 1 Medical Claims & Administrative Bundled Costs	\$24,853,339	\$24,209,025	\$22,105,981	\$21,821,341
Bundled Cost Savings - Year 1				
Bundled Cost Savings		(\$644,314)	(\$2,747,358)	(\$3,031,998)
Overall Estimated Percentage Change Including Administrative Costs, Repriced Claims, and Credits		-2.6%	-11.1%	-12.2%
Bundled Cost Savings - Years 2-5				
Bundled Cost Savings		(\$344,314)	(\$3,050,358)	(\$3,334,998)
Overall Estimated Percentage Change Including Administrative Costs, Repriced Claims, and Credits		-1.4%	-12.3%	-13.4%

¹All fees shown PEPM basis. Administrative fee includes PBM carve-out fees, stop loss carve-out fees, and broker fee. All fees outlined on following financial page.

²BCBS fee includes an applied guaranteed \$8 PEPM credit for 1% of in-network shared savings. This credit is proposed and guaranteed for 5 years. BCBS offers base \$40.49 administrative fee years 1 and 2, \$41.73 years 3 and 4, and \$43.02 year 5. BCBS net cost also includes one-time Rx carve-out integration fee of \$10,000.

³If the district were move to BCBS, UHC would charge a fee for processing claims incurred prior to termination date but processed after termination date. 12 months of runout is calculated in net cost.

Monthly and annual administrative costs are calculated from 2,965 subscribers.

Plan Funding Rates – Actuarial Suggested Renewal



	UnitedHealthcare			UnitedHealthcare			Blue Cross Blue Shield		
	Choice HSP	Choice	Choice Plus	Choice HSP	Choice	Choice Plus	Plan 1 Match	Plan 2 Match	Plan 3 Match
	HDHP	HMO	PPO	HDHP	HMO	PPO	HDHP	HMO	PPO
	Current - UHC and ExpressScripts (ESI)			Renewing with BCBS and ESI - No Plan Design Changes			Renewing with BCBS and ESI - No Plan Design Changes		
TOTAL PREMIUM									
Employee Only	\$711.51	\$863.88	\$997.45	\$753.93	\$915.38	\$1,056.92	\$696.76	\$845.97	\$976.77
Employee + Spouse	\$1,292.56	\$1,669.22	\$1,927.26	\$1,369.62	\$1,768.73	\$2,042.16	\$1,265.76	\$1,634.61	\$1,887.30
Employee + Child(ren)	\$1,233.24	\$1,592.39	\$1,838.51	\$1,306.76	\$1,687.32	\$1,948.12	\$1,207.67	\$1,559.38	\$1,800.39
Full Family	\$1,694.13	\$2,187.48	\$2,525.52	\$1,795.13	\$2,317.89	\$2,676.08	\$1,659.01	\$2,142.13	\$2,473.16
Total Monthly Premium		\$3,073,336.03			\$3,256,557.94			\$3,009,619.60	
Total Annual Premium		\$36,880,032.36			\$39,078,695.28			\$36,115,435.20	
Gross Increase/Decrease from Current					5.96%			-2.07%	

Actuarial funding rate renewals are calculated with projected medical and pharmacy claims experience, network discounting and repricing (via medical ASO network contracts), projected reimbursements (including stop loss recoveries), administrative fees, and pharmacy rebates.

These projections do not account for discretionary administrative, or wellness credits offered which equate to \$225,000 in year 1 from BCBS and \$700,000 in year 1 from UnitedHealthcare.

Network Discounts

UnitedHealthcare				
Claim Type	Network Charges	Network Discount (%) (AVERAGE)	Network Savings	Network Allowed
Facility	\$45,776,361		\$31,173,702	\$14,602,659
Professional	\$27,791,147		\$18,925,771	\$8,865,376
TOTAL	\$73,567,508	68.1%	\$50,099,473	\$23,468,035

Florida Blue				
Claim Type	Network Charges	Network Discount (%) (AVERAGE)	Network Savings	Network Allowed
Facility	\$45,776,361		\$33,050,533	\$12,725,828
Professional	\$27,791,147		\$20,065,208	\$7,725,939
TOTAL	\$73,567,508	72.2%	\$53,115,741	\$20,451,767
Difference from Current	\$3,016,268			

Because not all vendors responded equally in repricing analysis, an average network discount is used to recalculate claims.
Claims repriced were paid between January 1, 2024, and December 31, 2024.

Provider Comparison Analysis Overview



	UnitedHealthcare		BCBS Florida		BCBS Florida	
	Current No Disruption		BlueSelect "AltNEt" for Florida and BlueCard PPO for all other states		BlueCare Network	
	# of Providers	%	# of Providers	%	# of Providers	%
Number of providers reviewed	6,153		6,153	100%	6,153	100%
In Network	5,978	97.2%	5,956	96.8%	5,327	86.6%
Out-of-Network	175	2.8%	197	3.2%	826	13.4%
	# of Providers	%	# of Providers	%	# of Providers	%
In network with current carrier and out with new carrier	-	-	153	2.5%	762	12.4%
Out of network with current carrier and in with new carrier	-	-	134	2.2%	114	1.9%

Additional Financials – High Level Overview



	UnitedHealthcare (Current)	UnitedHealthcare (Renewal)	BCBS
Telehealth	Included as claims expense	Included as claims expense	\$0.90 - Teladoc (\$32,022 Annually)
Nurseline	Included - Triage	Included - Triage	Included - MD Live
Rx Carve-Out Integration Cost	-	-	One Time \$10,000
Fiduciary Fee	Included	Included	Included
Wellness Program Access	UHC Rewards Included	UHC Rewards Included	Personify Health \$1 - \$2.25
			(\$1 Package: \$35,580 Annually)
			(\$2.25 Package: \$80,055 Annually)
Weight Management	Real Appeal Included	Real Appeal Included	Included
HSA Administration	-	Included	\$2.25 PPPM
FSA Administration	\$3.04 PPPM	\$3.04 PPPM	\$4.25 PPPM
Rx Carve-Out	Included	Included	Included
Stop-Loss Carve-Out	Included	Included	Included
Broker Commissions	\$1.00	\$1.00	\$1.00

PPPM- Per Participant Per Month.

PEPM – Per Employee Per Month (medical subscriber).

Broker fee and Rx Carve-out integration cost applied on previous slide.

Vendor Capabilities

Member Technical Capabilities

Mobile App & Online Access

- Electronic ID Card
- Provider Search
- Where to Find Care Features
- Claims Access
- Price Estimating
- Plan Information
- Customer Service Accessibility
- Telehealth (Multiple Options)
- Digital Resources



Administrative Overview



In-depth **Reporting**
Capabilities¹

Extensive **Compliance**
Assistance and
Currently in Compliance
with all State & Federal
Guidelines

Accommodating &
Timely **Implementation**
Timeline¹

Ability to work with
current Benefits
Administration
Enrollment System²

Streamlined **Billing &
Claims** Administration

Documented **Quality
Management** Programs
in Place coupled with
**Performance
Guarantees**³

¹All vendors provided detailed reporting package samples, implementation timeline samples,

²Current benefits administration system is BenefitFocus. Vendors able work with other benefits administration systems.

³Performance guarantees include fees at risk calculated as up to \$75,000, 15% of overall fee, or large set dollar amounts based on measure.



An  **NFP** Company